

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
EASTERN DISTRICT OF MICHIGAN  
SOUTHERN DIVISION**

ELNORA CARTHAN, *et al.*,

Plaintiffs,

Case No.: 5:16-cv-10444

v.

Hon. Judith E. Levy

GOVERNOR RICHARD D. SNYDER,  
*et al.*,

Defendants.

---

**STIPULATION AND ORDER TO EXTEND THE TIME FOR THE  
MDEQ EMPLOYEE DEFENDANTS and THE MDHHS EMPLOYEE  
DEFENDANTS TO ANSWER THE FOURTH AMENDED  
CONSOLIDATED CLASS ACTION COMPLAINT**

Plaintiffs, Defendants Bradley Wurfel, Liane Shekter Smith, Stephen Busch, Patrick Cook and Michael Prysby (the “MDEQ Employee Defendants”), and Defendants, Nancy Peeler and Robert Scott (the “MDHHS Employee Defendants”), by and through their respective counsel, hereby stipulate and agree to extend the deadline for the MDEQ Employee Defendants and the MDHHS Employee Defendants to answer the Fourth Consolidated Amended Class Complaint (Dkt. 620-3) as follows:

1. On April 1, 2019, this Court adopted Plaintiffs’ Fourth Consolidated Amended Class Complaint.
2. The parties agree to extend the deadline for the MDEQ Employee Defendants and MDHHS Employee Defendants to answer to the Fourth

Consolidated Amended Class Complaint until April 30, 2019 and request that the Court enter an Order to this effect.

Pursuant to ECF Rule 11(c), Plaintiffs, MDEQ Employee Defendants and MDHHS Employee Defendants request that a text-only order be entered granting this stipulation.

**STIPULATED AND AGREED TO:**

Dated April 16, 2019

/s/ Theodore J. Leopold (with permission)

**Theodore J. Leopold**  
**Cohen Milstein Sellers & Toll PLLC**  
Attorney for Plaintiffs  
110 New York Ave., N.W., Suite 500  
Washington, D.C. 20005  
Phone: (202) 408-4600  
[elevens@cohenmilstein.com](mailto:elevens@cohenmilstein.com)

/s/ Michael L. Pitt (with permission)

**Michael L. Pitt** (P24429)  
**Pitt McGehee Palmer & Rivers PC**  
Attorney for Plaintiffs  
117 W. Fourth Street, Suite 200  
Royal Oak, MI 48067  
Phone: (248) 398-9800  
[mpitt@pittlawpc.com](mailto:mpitt@pittlawpc.com)

/s/ Philip A. Grashoff, Jr.

**Philip A. Grashoff, Jr.** (P14279)  
**Smith Haughey Rice & Roegge**  
Attorneys for Defendant Stephen Busch  
100 Monroe Center, NW  
Grand Rapids, MI 49503  
Phone: (616) 774-8000  
[pgrashoff@shrr.com](mailto:pgrashoff@shrr.com)

/s/ Thaddeus E. Morgan (with permission)

**Thaddeus E. Morgan** (P47394)  
**Fraser Trebilcock Davis & Dunlap PC**  
Attorney for Defendant Liane Shekter-Smith  
124 W Allegan St Ste 1000  
Lansing, MI 48933-1736  
Phone: (517) 482-5800  
[tmorgan@fraserlawfirm.com](mailto:tmorgan@fraserlawfirm.com)

/s/ Michael S. Cafferty (with permission)

**Michael S. Cafferty** (P36616)

**Michael S. Cafferty & Associates PC**

Attorney for Defendant Nancy Peeler

333 W. Fort St., Ste. 1400

Detroit, MI 48226-3149

Phone: (313) 628-4717

[mcaff@aol.com](mailto:mcaff@aol.com)

/s/ Mary Chartier-Mittendorf (with permission)

**Mary Chartier-Mittendorf** (P65327)

**Chartier & Nyamfukudza PLC**

Attorney for Defendant Robert Scott

1905 Abbot Rd., Ste. 1

East Lansing, MI 48823-8571

Phone: (517) 885-3305

[mary@cndefenders.com](mailto:mary@cndefenders.com)

/s/ Charles E. Barbieri (with permission)

**Charles E. Barbieri** (P31793)

**Foster Swift Collins & Smith PC**

Attorney for Defendants Patrick Cook

and Michael Prysby

313 S Washington Sq.

Lansing, MI 48933-2114

Phone: (517) 371-8155

[cbarbieri@fosterswift.com](mailto:cbarbieri@fosterswift.com)

/s/ Michael Pattwell (with permission)

**Michael Pattwell** (P72419)

**Clark Hill PLC**

Attorney for Defendant Bradley Wurfel

500 Woodward Avenue, Suite 3500

Detroit, MI 48226-3435

Phone: (313) 965-8300

[mpattwell@clarkhill.com](mailto:mpattwell@clarkhill.com)